

14 THE EDITORIAL PAGE

WORDLY WISE
THERE'S NOTHING IN THE WORLD SO
DEMORALISING AS MONEY.
— SOPHOCLES

The Indian EXPRESS

FOUNDED BY

RAMNATH GOENKA

BECAUSE THE TRUTH INVOLVES US ALL

THE RECKONING

Was the demonetisation disruption worth it? It's a question for the government to answer

IN THE PERIOD immediately after demonetisation, there was expectation that it would bring a windfall for the Centre. To the extent that the scrapped Rs 500 and Rs 1,000 denomination notes were not deposited or exchanged at banks — especially by those who had hoarded their ill-gotten wealth significantly in cash — the resultant reduction in the Reserve Bank of India's (RBI) currency liabilities would generate a "profit", which it could then distribute as dividend to the government. But this did not happen. As the RBI's latest annual report has confirmed, Rs 15.28 lakh crore or 99 per cent of the Rs 15.44 lakh crore worth of the notes withdrawn overnight on November 8 was turned in. Far from realising a revenue bonanza — the original estimates put it at Rs 4-5 lakh crore — the RBI's surplus payable to the Centre out of its earnings for 2016-17 fell to Rs 30,659 crore, from Rs 65,876 crore the year before. As the central bank had to incur extra costs on printing of new notes, paying interest on the excess cash it was forced to absorb from banks, and making an unexplained additional provision of Rs 13,140 crore towards a so-called contingency fund, there was simply less surplus to distribute.

But fiscal cost is only one part. No less has been the damage to institutional credibility. The RBI is yet to convincingly demonstrate that the demonetisation decision was not forced on it. At any rate, it was ill-prepared to deal with the aftermath, in terms of making available adequate quantity of replacement notes in the right denominations. Proof of it was the serpentine queues in banks and at ATMs for well over two months. That remonetised notes are mostly of the illiquid Rs 2,000 denomination — constituting over 50 per cent of the total value of currency in circulation even as late as March 31 — didn't help matters. The economic costs that ensued — whether manifested in a crash in farm produce prices or a wide swathe of cash-dependent informal enterprises going bust, not to mention the sheer time wasted waiting in lines — are incalculable.

Were these disruptions worth it, especially when the Indian economy wasn't doing too badly before November 8? There is no doubt that demonetisation has created an environment where doing business in cash and avoiding taxes is less acceptable. Along with the goods and services tax (GST) — a seemingly better planned and well-thought-out exercise — it has the promise of heralding the transition to a less-cash economy. But these are gains that may accrue only in the medium- to long-term. While Uttar Pradesh's voters showed willingness to endure the immediate disruptions from demonetisation, whether such tolerance or even enthusiasm would hold if these — and also the effects of GST — last too long is a moot point.

WELL BEGUN

First steps to restructure army are welcome. Follow them up with reordering of higher defence management

THE APPROVAL OF the Union cabinet for the first phase of reforms in the armed forces is a welcome step. It will set into motion a plan to restructure the army which will redeploy 57,000 soldiers and civilians into fighting roles, thereby improving its operational efficiency. The idea is to improve the army's "teeth to tail" ratio, that is, increase the number of soldiers actually doing the fighting against those needed to support them to fight. This phase of reforms, which concern only the army, will be completed by end-2019. These reforms emanate from the recommendations of an expert committee headed by Lt General D.B. Shekatkar (ret'd), which was tasked to recommend measures for enhancing combat capability and rebalancing defence expenditure.

The committee submitted its report in December last year, and its 188 recommendations have been studied and debated by the ministry and the defence services. The defence ministry has chosen 99 recommendations which pertain to the army, navy and air force — 65 of them, which are internal to the army, have been approved for implementation in this phase. It is believed that the other 34, which are internal to the air force and the navy, will also be implemented soon. But there are bigger questions about the rest of the recommendations of the committee, which deal with higher defence management, defence ministry and other organisations, such as the DRDO, ordnance factories and DGQA. The ministry has been silent about these steps which would have far-reaching effects towards reforming and modernising the decision-making structure for national security.

Proposals, like the one that establishes the need for a Chief of Defence Staff or for ensuring 2.5-3 per cent of GDP as defence expenditure, need political and bureaucratic consensus beyond the scope of the defence ministry but have not been debated so far. There is a genuine fear in the defence services that by choosing to act on proposals internal to personnel management of the army, it has only picked the low-hanging fruit. These fears are based on the experience with implementation of reports of earlier committees. The toughest recommendations of both the Arun Singh Committee, following the Kargil Review Commission, and of the Naresh Chandra Committee, formed by UPA 2 government, were initially deferred and then never saw the light of day. With a live threat from both China and Pakistan, defence reforms are an urgent need of the hour. The first steps with restructuring the army are important but they must be quickly followed by implementation of other recommendations, particularly those of higher defence management. Anything less will be another opportunity lost.

CAT FIGHTS

Gujarat's refusal to part with Gir lions is churlish. MP's decision to introduce zoo-bred lions into forests is unwise

MADHYA PRADESH HAS waited for nearly two decades for lions to roar at the Kuno-Palpur National Park. In the 1990s, wildlife experts felt that confining the Asiatic Lion to the Gir National Park in Gujarat was not a good idea. The Wildlife Institute of India, Dehradun, carried out surveys to find a second home for the beast and recommended shifting some of the felines to Kuno. But the Gujarat government has termed the big cat as the "pride" of the state, and refused to share them with MP. An exasperated MP government has now decided to breed lion cubs in zoos and shift them to Kuno.

Till the late 19th century, the Asiatic lion roamed large parts of North India, as far east as what is today Bihar, with the Narmada river marking the southern limit of its range. But indiscriminate hunting and large-scale conversion of forests into farms and human-settlements proved to be the animal's doom. By the early 20th century, the deciduous forests of Gir were the Asiatic lion's only home. In 1913, the chief forest officer of Junagadh reported that there were only 20 of the majestic animals left in Gir. Since then, conservation efforts have not only saved the animal from extinction but resulted in a significant increase in their population. At the last census in 2015, the lions in Gir numbered 523.

Wildlife experts, however, believe that a disease outbreak or a natural disaster like a forest fire in the animal's only home could undo the conservation achievements of the past 100 years. However, Gujarat does not want to part with its lions. Conservation has taken a further backseat with the MP government's proposal to the Centre to allow Kuno to source cubs from zoos. The lion cubs will have to compete with other predators hardened with the ways of the forest. It is anybody's guess how they will fare.



ILA PATNAIK

THE RBI ANNUAL Report reveals that almost all demonetised notes have been returned to the central bank. This number does not include the old notes with District Central Cooperative Banks for the short window when they were allowed to accept deposits. It also does not include the notes within Nepal. The shortfall of Rs 16,050 crore between the notes in circulation when the notes were demonetised and those that were returned, could therefore also be made up once these notes are returned to the RBI.

It should come as no surprise that almost all the notes have been returned, including the stock of black money held as cash. To the extent that it was possible to exchange money legally, individuals did so. When cash limits for withdrawal made it difficult, friends and families participated. The inconvenience of long queues was overcome by household staff. A private company offered booking of "chhotus", who would stand in long queues for people for Rs 90 an hour until their turn came. Bank employees were averse to being unhelpful to regular customers and found ways to serve them. Innumerable ways were found to work around the changing rules of exchange, cash limits, indelible ink and specified uses of old notes.

Those who could not exchange money legally found money changers. Innumerable anecdotes, media reports and arrests of bank staff tell stories about how this was done all over the country. When the government announced that old notes could no longer be exchanged, but only deposited, new ways of changing the stock of unaccounted cash emerged. Individuals with bank accounts, including Jan Dhan accounts, and companies showing cash accrual from sales came into business. Large amounts could be laundered through this route as it did not involve immediate cash payouts by banks, since cash shortages still persisted with the RBI and banks scrambling to remonetise the economy.

It was to be expected that even if people have to pay tax on their hoarded cash, and a change fee, they would prefer to do that rather than lose the whole amount. Data

Maximum pain

Objectives of demonetisation could have been served better by doing a cost benefit analysis

International evidence suggests that few countries address the problem of black money by demonetising their currencies. If the problem is large-scale crime, corruption, bureaucrat-politician nexus, tax evasion etc. the answer lies in reforming the criminal justice system, law and order, administrative reforms, bringing transparency in the functioning of the state and rationalisation and simplification of the tax system. In this context, the GST will be a far more effective mechanism to bring down tax evasion in indirect taxes considering the greater incentive for compliance that its design holds.

from Prowess, a database of companies in India, shows that in the quarter of demonetisation, when purchasing power had fallen sharply, net sales by companies rose significantly. At the same time, the number of tax payers and tax collections rose. The tax department is said to have found thousands of shell companies which were possibly engaging in the activity of depositing money in their accounts during the demonetisation period, claiming that it was cash from sales. This provided a means for laundering money.

The total currency in circulation, according to the RBI's annual report, is about Rs 2 lakh crore short of the pre-demonetisation period. This is partly due to the increase in focus on printing of lower denomination currency notes. Initially, the RBI had focused on printing the Rs 2,000 notes to rapidly remonetise the economy. In addition, there could be some reluctance to hold cash. The replacement of cash transactions by digital transactions, the slowdown in small-scale industry, in the rural economy, construction and other informal segments of the economy could also lead to somewhat lower demand for cash. However, it is less probable that the cash of black money holders has not been withdrawn because they are unlikely to leave that in the bank accounts of the money launderers for long. It might have partly been settled for bitcoins, gold, or similar assets that are difficult to trace.

There is no doubt that those with holdings of unaccounted cash lost some of their wealth in the process of laundering it. To some extent, taxes were paid on it in the process of legitimising it. But in addition to that, illicit wealth was redistributed from black money holders to money launderers. Whether the money launderer was a company owner, a bank employee or a Jan Dhan account holder, there was now a need breed of criminals with wealth obtained from illegal means. The total reduction in black money was therefore much smaller than what might have been envisaged.

International evidence suggests that few countries address the problem of black

money by demonetising their currencies. If the problem is large-scale crime, corruption, bribery, bureaucrat-politician nexus, rent seeking, tax evasion etc. the answer lies in reforming the criminal justice system, law and order, administrative reforms, bringing transparency in the functioning of the state and rationalisation and simplification of the tax system. In this context, the GST will be a far more effective mechanism to bring down tax evasion in indirect taxes considering the greater incentive for compliance that its design holds.

The real rationale for new notes by the RBI is a rather innocuous paragraph hidden away in its Annual Report. It says: "As a standard international practice, the design and security features of banknotes are reviewed periodically. In line with this practice, a new series (Mahatma Gandhi New Series) of banknotes in new design, dimensions and denominations, highlighting the cultural heritage and scientific achievements of the country, was introduced during the year. As part of this process, banknotes in the denominations of 500 and 2000 were introduced on November 8, 2016. New design notes in other denominations are due for phased introduction." (Section VIII.15, RBI Annual Report 2016-17).

The best way of achieving this objective would have been to slowly replace old notes with new ones, giving the public adequate time to exchange and deposit old notes, as is also "standard international practice". The outcome would have been the same. The pain would have been much lower.

This episode in India's policy-making highlights an essential tenet of policy-making — the need for a cost benefit analysis. For any objective that is to be achieved, we need to examine various policy options and analyse their costs and efficacy. For an economy on the path of reform, with many more reforms still to come, long-term sustainable impact can be achieved only when we strengthen the policy-making process as well.

The writer is professor, National Institute of Public Finance and Policy



JAVED ANAND

GIVEN THE AUDACITY with which our history is being rewritten and re-imagined, we should not be surprised to learn in the not-too-distant future that the "chatur baniya", Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi, was actually a devout pracharak of the Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh who was killed by a fanatic Muslim.

Soon after Narendra Modi became prime minister, Gandhi was given charge of the Swachh Bharat Abhiyan. Virtually reduced to the status of a Super Sanitary Inspector, the Mahatma's job was to ensure clean streets; never mind the muck in the minds. We must thank the BJP general secretary, Ram Madhav, for putting Gandhi back on a pedestal. From Madhav's learned treatise ("Coming full circle at 70", IE, August 15) we learn that unlike Jawaharlal Nehru whose mind was infected with the "coloniser's view", Gandhi was infused with "the genius of our country which is rooted in its religio-social structures like state, family, caste, guru, festival".

According to this version of modern Indian history, Nehru and his Congress took India down the wrong road for decades but fortunately, happy days are here again. India has a president, vice president and PM all of whom are from "the same ideological fraternity", all in tune with India's "native wisdom", all from the "Conservative Right". Gandhi, we are told, belongs to the same fraternity. How? Because: "Gandhi always spoke in his discourses and dissertations about Ram Rajya".

Hitler's master propagandist Joseph Goebbels said: "If you tell a lie big enough and keep repeating it, people will eventually come

THE BIG LIES

US conservatives made Trump denounce hate. RSS can learn from them

Why did Nathuram Godse, an RSS-Hindu Mahasabha creation, assassinate Gandhi? And why did the RSS, according to the then Home Minister Vallabhbhai Patel, distribute sweets to celebrate the murder? Had he been around today how would Gandhi have responded to Hindutva's lynch mobs repeatedly targeting Muslims and Dalits in the name of the holy cow? What might the Mahatma have said about the lip service, at best, of the PM in response to this?

to believe it". Perhaps we will all one day buy the Big Lie that Gandhi was an RSS man. But for now, could Madhav and the Sangh Parivar kindly take a few questions: Gandhi repeatedly said: "Let no one commit the mistake of thinking that Ram Rajya means a rule of Hindus. My Ram is another name for Khuda or God. I want Khuda Raj which is the same thing as the Kingdom of God on Earth." Is Gandhi's "Ram Rajya" the same as the "Hindu Rashtra" ideal of the Sangh Parivar?

If yes, why did Nathuram Godse, an RSS-Hindu Mahasabha creation, assassinate Gandhi? And why did the RSS, according to the then Home Minister Vallabhbhai Patel, distribute sweets to celebrate the murder? Had he been around today, how would Gandhi have responded to Hindutva's lynch mobs repeatedly targeting Muslims and Dalits in the name of the holy cow? What might the Mahatma have said about the lip service, at best, of the PM in response to this continuing majoritarian onslaught?

Even as the Sangh Parivar is doing all it can to claim Gandhi, its hostility to Nehru remains undiminished. This is so, Madhav tells us, because Nehru was a "liberal" while the "genius of India", like America, tilts towards the "Conservative Right". The RSS ideologue approvingly quotes a book which describes America as "essentially a nation with a conservative ethos", a nation where even the Democrats are "liberals in name only".

India and America: Same, same? The US is not my idea of heaven on earth and Donald Trump is certainly not my hero. But there's a strong message that conserva-

tive America recently sent out to the world, a message India's "Conservative Right" can learn from.

When neo-Nazis and white supremacists turned violent against peaceful counter-protesters in Charlottesville, Virginia, last month, Trump initially blamed "many sides". But "conservative" Americans were so outraged by the misdeeds of the extremists that speaking in one voice, politicians — including top Republicans — corporate big guns, the media and ordinary citizens slammed their president, shamed him into changing his tune within 48 hours.

This is what US conservatives pushed the right-wing, Republican Trump into saying: "Racism is evil and those who cause violence in its name are criminals and thugs, including the KKK, neo-Nazis and white supremacists and other hate groups... We will spare no resource in fighting so that every American child can grow up free from violence and fear".

Sounds good: Freedom from violence and fear. In an India plagued by lynch mobs and acute Islamophobia, when did we hear the Sangh Parivar, its incumbent president, vice-president, prime minister, speak such language? Should India's "Conservative Right" not be ashamed at its own silence, if not complicity, over the recurring ugly spectacles and yet claim fraternity with Gandhi and affinity with America's "conservative ethos"?

The writer is convener, Indian Muslims for Secular Democracy and Co-Editor, Sabrang India



SEPTEMBER 1, 1977, FORTY YEARS AGO

BHUTTO ARREST
THE FORMER PRIME minister of Pakistan, Z.A. Bhutto, may be arrested and tried before a specially constituted court for political murders and treason. One of the main charges against him is he was responsible for the creation of Bangladesh as an independent and sovereign state. Diplomats say General Zia-ul-Haque is weighing the pros and cons and only after he is satisfied that Bhutto's arrest would not lead to further complications would he take the fateful step. Bhutto has warned that if he is arrested, the consequences for the country may be unpredictable. If he arrests Bhutto, the general will also have to postpone the

elections he had promised to hold on October 18.

PRESIDENT'S RESIDENCE
PRESIDENT SANJIVA REDDY is likely to shift his residence from his present North Court suite in Rashtrapati Bhavan to a bungalow on the President's Estate. The choice is likely to fall on No 1, President's Estate, a bungalow with its entrance on Sardar Patel Marg. The late Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed used to live there when he was minister for agriculture. This was the house the builder of New Delhi, Edward Lutyens, had built for himself. He lived there for 15 years as he went about the task of constructing the rest of what was

then called the Government House and the secretariat complex.

PATEL FOR RBI
I.G. PATEL IS taking over as governor of the Reserve Bank in December. Patel, now holding a UNDP assignment, paid a visit to the RBI headquarters. According to reliable sources, the purpose of his visit was to familiarise himself with the working of the RBI and with its officials. At the time of the exit of the former RBI governor, K.R. Puri, Patel was tipped as the successor but his contractual obligations with the UNDP held him from accepting the post immediately. Patel's term with the UNDP is ending in November.

